



CSCCC
Civil Society Coalition for
Climate Change



Post COP23 Report



Post COP23 Report

Civil Society Coalition for Climate Change

Copyright © 2017 Civil Society Coalition for Climate Change (CSCCC)

Suggested reference: Civil Society Coalition for Climate Change (2017). Post COP23 Report.

Lead Author: Shafqat Kakakhel

Co Author: Farrukh Zaman

This report has been produced with the assistance of the European Union.

3rd Floor 14 Feroz Center, Block D, Fazl-ul-Haq Road, Blue Area, Islamabad 44000, Pakistan
www.csgcc.org.pk info@csgcc.org.pk

Table of Contents

Executive Summary.....	5
Introduction	6
Key Outcomes of COP23	7
What happened at Bonn?	7
From Marrakesh to Bonn: A Recap.....	8
Key Results from COP23.....	8
Pakistan’s Role at COP23 and recommendations for COP24	10
Specific recommendations for COP24.	11

Executive Summary

The main objective of inter- governmental negotiations on climate change which will resume in Bonn (April 28-May 11, 2018) is to resolve outstanding differences over the operational details of the key elements of the historic Paris Agreement adopted in December 2015. Negotiations during the previous two conferences of parties to the UN Climate Change Convention (UNFCCC) and the Paris Agreement (COPs 22 and 23 and CMA 1) in Marrakech and Bonn had made only limited progress. The elaboration of the Paris Agreement (described as the Rule Book) is indispensable for the smooth implementation of the Paris Agreement from 2020 onward.

The on- going negotiations must culminate in consensus on all issues related to the Paris Agreement at COP24 in the Polish city of Katowice (December 3-14, 2018). A 12-page document called ' Progress Tracker' compiled by the UN Climate Change Secretariat indicates serious disagreements among the Parties to the Paris Agreement (largely between the developed and developing countries along the old and familiar North- South divide). This document barely conceals the chilling fact that the unfinished agenda comprises more than 120 topics concerning the crucial subjects of mitigation; adaptation; finance, in particular resources for supporting developing countries in their climate actions; the voluntary Nationally Determined Contributions (NDCs) pledged by all Parties for mitigation and adaptation; development and deployment of climate- friendly technology; capacity in developing countries to address the causes and effects of climate change; the process of periodic review and upscaling of the NDCs and measures to ensure transparency and efficacy of all climate- related initiatives by the Parties.

This paper offers a broad overview of the outcome of COP 23 and the heavy load of work that negotiators must accomplish before and at COP 24 making the current year especially challenging. It also reviews the contribution of Pakistan's official delegation at COP 23 consisting of attending the consultations among developing country negotiators and endorsing the common positions of the developing countries on all contentious topics. The paper refers to the several stakeholder consultations convened by the newly formed Civil Society Coalition for Climate Change (CSCCC) in 2017 in consultation and cooperation with the Ministry of Climate Change and other climate- related departments to articulate Pakistan's concerns and priorities concerning the range of issues being addressed by the Intergovernmental negotiations. The outcomes of the consultations and inputs by experts commissioned by the CSCCC were presented in a comprehensive policy brief shared with relevant national institutions and Pakistani delegates at COP 23.

The paper stresses the urgency of the earliest possible operationalization of the landmark Climate Bill approved by the Parliament in March 2017. It also recommends that the Ministry of Climate Change and the CSCCC continue their collaboration during 2018 as part of preparations for the crucial inter- governmental negotiations in the run up to and at COP 24.

Introduction

The twenty third session of the Conference of the Parties (COP23) to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) was convened from 6-17 November 2017, in Bonn, Germany, under the Presidency of Fiji. The annual climate conference also hosted the thirteenth session of the Conference of the Parties serving as the Meeting of the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol (CMP12), and the second session of the Conference of the Parties serving as the Meeting of the Parties to the Paris Agreement (CMA1-2). Negotiations also took place under three subsidiary bodies, including Subsidiary Body on Implementation (SBI), Subsidiary Body on Scientific and Technological Advice (SBSTA), and Ad-Hoc Working Group on the Paris Agreement (APA1-4).

The Conference brought together over 16,000 participants, including over 9,200 officials, 5,500 representatives of UN bodies and agencies, intergovernmental organization and civil society organizations, and 1,200 members of the media (IISD, 2017).

Hailed by many as a technical, procedural COP, the negotiations picked up the issues from the last conference in Marrakech in 2016, and subsequent intersessional meeting in Bonn in May 2017, to finalize the rulebook to operationalize the Paris Agreement (PA) and its supporting decisions. As is a normal with these negotiations now, the climate talks were concluded after several hours of delay when countries adopted the Fiji Momentum for Implementation that reaffirms their commitment to adopt the Paris Rulebook at COP24 in Katowice, Poland in 2018. It also sets out the design of the facilitative dialogue – now known as Talanoa Dialogue – which will accept views from all stakeholders to UNFCCC on how to move forward with the implementation of the Paris Agreement. It also confirms that the global stocktakes will take place at both COP24 and COP25, which is a crucial platform to ensure that countries are fulfilling their commitments under the Paris Agreement.

In the run-up to the Conference, the Civil Society Coalition for Climate Change (CSCCC) organized a series of policy consultations in collaboration with the Ministry of Climate Change on key agenda items for COP23, including: adaptation and mitigation; loss and damage; means of implementation; transparency and MRV; nationally determined contributions. The consultations welcomed representatives of relevant government ministries and line agencies, civil society, academia, and the media to promote whole of government and whole of civil society approaches. These approaches were also in line with the Lima Paris Action Agenda that encourages the roles of state and non-state actors in accelerating climate action globally. The consultations resulted in a policy document titled, “Framing Pakistan’s Agenda for COP23: Policy Recommendations from Consultative Workshops” that suggested policy redlines and recommendations to the participants that attended COP23 Conference.

Key Outcomes of COP23

What happened at Bonn?

Despite being considered as a procedural COP, COP23 managed to result in the adoption of 31 decisions, including 24 under the COP and 7 under the CMP, which has provided key guidance to countries to complete the outstanding negotiations on the Paris Agreement work plan. COP23 also launched a facilitative dialogue process – the Talaona Dialogue – and highlighted the importance for achieving pre-2020 climate commitments. In addition, a range of other important decisions were adopted, such as deciding that Adaptation Fund shall serve the Paris Agreement (subject to subsequent decisions at CMA1-3). Countries also managed to operationalize the local communities and indigenous peoples' platform; established a gender action plan; assessed the technical examination process on mitigation and adaptation; extended the work programme on long term finance; and concluded reviews of the Standing Committee on Finance, the Adaptation Fund, capacity building, and the Warsaw International Mechanism for Loss and Damage associated with Climate Change Impacts.

However, COP23, failed to accomplish the unfinished agenda of operationalizing the key elements of the PA in order to ensure its effective implementation from 2020. The enormity of the task required to develop the Paris Rule Book was recognized by the decision of the Bonn conference to approve an additional session of negotiations between the inter-sessional round in May and COP24 in Katowice (Poland) in December 2018. Given the huge volume of the work at hand and the divergences in positions of the Parties on nearly all issues shaped by the long - standing distrust between developing and developed countries , it will require significant effort to reach consensus on the rulebook of the Paris Agreement at COP24.

The conference started inauspiciously. Developing countries were unhappy that the formal agenda of the conference did not include up- front an item on “Pre- 2020 Ambition”, euphemism for support by the developed countries for mitigation and adaptation actions by developing countries until 2020 when the windows of the Paris Agreement open and deliver. The entire first week was expended on long and contentious debates on the subject. The major concerns of developing countries were that the developed countries had not taken any significant steps to deliver the 100 billion dollars promised since the Copenhagen COP in 2009; had not ratified the Doha Amendment to the Kyoto Protocol (KP) aimed at sustaining its commitments; and were reluctant to provide funds for the Green Climate Fund (GCF) from public sources. They also demanded that a substantial part of the funding by the GCF should be grants. The efforts of the developing countries, ably spearheaded by India, were able to achieve was an additional, inter-governmental dialogue in 2019 to review the pre- 2020 assistance channels. Developed countries also agreed that two assessments of climate finance would be issued in 2018 and 2020.

As noted by the New Delhi- based Centre for Science and Environment, the United States”” rogue and obstructionist attitude in the COP process ensured that progress was extremely slow

and hampered on several occasions and the old divide between developed and developing countries remained”. The US attitude made it impossible to make progress on several issues, including equity and finance, in relation to stock take, accounting, enhanced transparency framework, adaptation, and technology transfer”. The US delegates were exceptionally negative on the two key, inter- related concerns of developing countries: finance and amelioration of the losses and damage inflicted by the impacts of climate change in developing countries, known as Loss and Damage which was recognized by the Paris Agreement.

[From Marrakesh to Bonn: A Recap](#)

To recap, the adoption of the Paris Agreement at COP21 redirected the course of global action on climate change and brought together more than 190 countries to commit to taking individual efforts to limit global temperatures exceeding 1.5 to 2 degrees. Countries agreed to give themselves three years, until COP24, to negotiate detailed rules, guidelines, and procedures for implementing the agreement, which was termed as the Paris rulebook. The following year, the Paris Agreement saw an unprecedented support from the global community that resulted in its ratification by a record number of countries and an early entry into force. Hence, in Marrakech, the COP held its first CMA for the Paris Agreement and decided to start discussions on finalizing the rulebook. In Bonn, countries moved from conceptualizing the rulebook to more technical negotiations. Through informal consultations, the co-chairs of the APA managed to compile parties’ views and produced informal notes in a 266-page document, which will serve as the basis for the negotiating text to be developed in Katowice.

[Key Results from COP23](#)

The key results of COP 23 are summarized below:

- On the central subject of a framework of the Nationally Determined Contribution (NDCs)- mitigation and adaptation commitments by all Parties, rich and poor, big and small- to achieve the goal of limiting increase of temperature to a maximum of 2 degrees Celsius compared to pre- Industrial level, the outcome was a 179 page compilation of Parties’ positions on various aspects of the NDCs. The volume of the document highlights the vast differences and the challenge of resolving them.
- Transparency of actions by all Parties related to implementation of NDCs eluded a consensus. Developed countries insisted on stringent measures relating to reporting and verification which should be binding on all Parties whilst developing countries called for “differentiated”, flexible standards of transparency. Divergences on this issue are evidenced by a 46 page compilation of the Parties’ divergent views.
- Finance, the perennial contentious issue in all climate change negotiations, once again resulted in protracted negotiations in Bonn. The two most difficult points were the assurances sought by developing countries about the predictability of the USD 100 billion and adequate funds for the Adaptation Fund whose coffers had dwindled to less than USD90 million. Developed countries demanded that COP23 decision “

acknowledge the steps taken by Parties and multilateral development banks in developing methodologies on reporting climate finance and encourage multilateral development banks to enhance their cooperation in scaling up climate finance and improving their methodologies on reporting climate finance". In the event, the decision adopted "welcomed with appreciation progress of developed countries towards reaching the goal of jointly mobilizing USD100 Billion by 2020".

- Loss and Damage (L&D) Mechanism: Developing countries see this as the so- called "third pillar" of climate action along with mitigation and adaptation. Developed countries had agreed to the establishment of the Warsaw International Mechanism on Loss and Damage in order to save COP19 from collapse. The same is true of the reference to it in the PA but in the post- Paris negotiations, including COP23, they have refused to agree on providing money for the Mechanism. The COP 23 decision on the subject does not hold any promise and merely provides for an expert dialogue on L&D in April/May 2018 and more discussion in 2019. Climate Action South Asia (CANSA) has predicted that at COP24 developing countries will persist in efforts to get a decision on placing the subject as a permanent item on the agenda of future COPs.
- Negotiations during COP 23 made limited progress on other pending issues, including operational details of the Facilitative Dialogues re- named Talanoa Dialogues, accounting of climate finance and other support as well as mitigation and adaptation actions.
- The Climate Change- Agriculture/Food Security Nexus. Perhaps the most notable positive outcome of COP 23 was the decision requesting "the Subsidiary Body on Science and Technology (SBSTA) and the Subsidiary Body on Implementation (SBI) to consider issues relating to agriculture including through workshops and expert meetings, working with constituted bodies under the Convention, the vulnerabilities of agriculture to climate change and approaches to addressing food security". The decision requested Parties to send comments by March 31, 2018 ahead of the forthcoming, 48th meeting of SBSTA and SBI in April 2018. The agriculture- climate change nexus will be considered in the stock-take in 2020 during COP26.
- Other significant positive results were the gender- related decision on supporting capacity building of women and improving the participation and representation of women in climate negotiations and actions, and the decision on operationalization of the Local Communities and Indigenous Peoples' Platform. In pursuance of the latter, the Parties and the climate – related support mechanisms will support activities relating to education, Capacity Building and incorporation of the diverse and traditional knowledge systems in national and international climate change actions and policies. At COP 25 the progress achieved on Gender Action Plan will be reviewed.
- Climate Change activists have also welcomed the formation and launch, during COP23, of a 20- nation anti- coal alliance called "Powering Past the Coal Alliance", led by the UK and Canada, to try to effect the phasing out of coal- based energy production by 2030 in

OECD countries and 2050 in the rest of the world. Whilst lauding the political significance of the initiative, climate change experts have lamented that the countries which have joined the Alliance accounted for just 3% of global coal users while big coal countries such as Poland, India, Germany, and Australia had kept away.

The meagre progress of COP23 and the target of finalizing the operationalization of the Paris Agreement at COP24 means an exceptionally heavy work load for the negotiations during 2018, including the meetings of the two subsidiary committees on implementation and science and technology, the Adaptation Committee, the Executive Committee of the Warsaw Mechanism on Loss and Damage, the inter- sessional in May, the additional global negotiations, and finally, COP24. The negotiations are likely to be protracted as well as polemical along the North – South divide.

Pakistan's Role at COP23 and recommendations for COP24

Until COP 15 in Copenhagen in 2009, Pakistan's delegations at COPs were invariably very small and limited to a few officials of the former Ministry of Environment, much like the Pakistan delegations in the COPs of the other major environmental agreements, including the Biodiversity Convention, at present .However, since the Copenhagen conference the size of the Pakistani delegations has grown significantly. Our delegation at COP23 comprised over forty (40) members drawn from different federal and provincial ministries, autonomous departments and civil society representatives. During the Copenhagen and subsequent COPS until COP20 all Pakistani participants, including representatives of NGOs and civil society, were also designated as members of the official delegation with access to the inter- governmental negotiations. This enabled the core team to consult civil society on the on- going negotiations. Civil society delegates also represented Pakistan at the discussions convened by Parties and UN and multilateral agencies. However, this practice is no longer followed. Civil Society participants who wear Party Badges are known as overflow delegates. All overflow delegates support and assist their country representatives. Although the Pakistani civil society participants self-finance their travel and other logistical expenses, but regrettably their presence is not utilized optimally.

At COP 23 members of the small official delegation comprising three officials each from the Foreign Office and M/ O Climate Change as well as a few others representing autonomous bodies and provincial governments participated in the negotiations on the key issues related to the Rule Book of the Paris and other issues. They regularly attended the coordination meetings of G77 aimed at forging the common positions of developing countries on the issues being negotiated. The Minister of Climate Change, Mr Mushahidullah Khan, represented Pakistan during the High Level Segment of COP23. He participated in several meetings in which he mentioned the significant climate change- related steps taken by the Government, especially the

key features of the Climate Bill. The civil society representatives attended meetings organized by UN agencies and international civil society organizations at another venue. In view of the anticipated proliferation of negotiation groups charged with resolving specific contentious issues, members of our small official delegation could not participate in all negotiations.

In the negotiations during COP23, more knowledgeable, better skilled, and experienced delegates from other countries served as spokespersons for G77 and the Group of Like-minded Countries. However, participation in these negotiations is always useful to acquire a deeper knowledge and understanding of major climate change issues in general and the provisions of the Paris Agreements in particular. The enhanced understanding of the contentious issues would be useful during the resumed negotiations in the current year. Members of Pakistan's civil society briefed their counterparts on Pakistan's vulnerabilities to climate change, the approval of the Climate Change Bill by the Parliament in March 2017, and the efforts made by the Government and civil society to promote climate friendly programs, including development and deployment of renewable energy sources.

Being a Party to the 1992 UN Climate Change Convention and the 2015 Paris Agreement, Pakistan must continue to participate in all future COPs of the two agreements and meetings of the governing bodies of support mechanisms established in pursuance of the PA, such as the Green Climate Fund, the Adaptation Fund, and the Technology and Capacity Mechanisms. Pakistan's participation is indeed critical in view of its vulnerability to all the adverse impacts of climate change as well as the imperative of strengthening the capacities of the federal and provincial institutions addressing climate change-related subjects.

Specific recommendations for COP24.

1. Submission of comments and information to UNFCCC Secretariat: A number of decisions adopted at COP23 have called on Parties to provide inputs on a number of issues, including the activities related to the linkages between climate change and agriculture. The Ministry of Climate Change (MOCC) must ensure that the requests of COP 23 for information and comments are duly complied with. The M/O CC will also participate in the Inter- sessional negotiations in May and the additional meeting agreed at Bonn and share their reports with officials of the other ministries and departments as well as civil society experts on climate change.
2. International and Pakistani civil society organizations have all along supported the activities of Pakistan's ministries and departments as well as autonomous institutions dealing with issues concerning environment and climate change. The Ministry of Climate Change has maintained this tradition. Accordingly, M/O CC welcomed the establishment of the Civil Society Coalition on Climate Change (CSCCC) in early 2017 which includes a number of major civil society organizations devoted entirely or partially to climate change-related activities. In 2017, in the run up to COP23, the Minister and senior officials of the M/O CC supported the activities undertaken by the CSCCC to raise awareness and knowledge of climate change issues and the Paris Agreement and post-2015 negotiations, focusing on the agenda of COP23. The CSCCC activities included the holding of workshops on mitigation, adaptation, Climate finance, Loss and Damage

and other issues as seen from the prism of Pakistan's climate change landscape. The outcomes of the workshops were synthesized into set of recommendations to frame Pakistan's position at COP23 for the Pakistan delegation. The compilation also served as a highly useful tool kit for those attending COP23 for the first time. It would be useful to make such consultations a regular feature of pre-COP preparations.

3. The M/O CC should collaborate with the Department of Meteorology, the National Disaster Management Authority, the Global Change Impact Study Centre and civil society organizations in organizing briefing sessions for officials of other line ministries such as the Ministry of Food Security and the Ministry of Water Resources as well as all provinces on developments pertaining to climate change and seek their inputs.
4. The Government of Pakistan, in particular the M/ O CC, should redouble efforts to operationalize the key institutions enshrined in the Climate Bill adopted by the Parliament in March 2017, including the Climate Change Council, the Climate Change Authority and the Climate Change Fund, as well as expedite the on- going work on the elaboration of Pakistan's Action Plans on Mitigation and Adaptation. Apart from participation in negotiations the Pakistani delegation should network actively with delegates from other countries and the multilateral inter- governmental and non-governmental organizations about climate change- related institutions and seek their support and assistance for strengthening Pakistan's capacity to address climate change issues.
5. As noted earlier, the positive outcomes of COP23 included a decision on capacity building of women and enhancing women's participation in climate negotiations and actions. Progress in the implementation of this decision will be reviewed in 2019. The M/ O CC and civil society organizations should work with the organizations devoted to gender action in implementing the gender decision approved in Bonn last year.
6. Given the growing and crucial role of the electronic and print media, the M/ O CC and civil society should make special efforts to keep our media regularly briefed on climate change negotiations and their relevance for Pakistan.